20191204154623 Filed Date: 12/04/2019 State Corporation Commission of Kansas

#### LAW OFFICES OF

## ANDERSON & BYRD

A Limited Liability Partnership

JOHN L. RICHESON
JAMES G. FLAHERTY
R. SCOTT RYBURN
KEITH A. BROCK
THOMAS H. SACHSE
KRISTINA J. BRANSTETTER

216 S. HICKORY, P. O. BOX 17 OTTAWA, KANSAS 66067 (785) 242-1234, *Telephone* (785) 242-1279, *Facsimile* www.andersonbyrd.com ROBERT A. ANDERSON (1920-1994)

RICHARD C. BYRD (1920-2008)

December 4, 2019

via e-filing EXPRESS

Ms. Lynn M. Retz Executive Director Kansas Corporation Commission 1500 S. W. Arrowhead Road Topeka, Kansas 66604-4027

Re: Atmos Energy Corporation

Docket No. 19-ATMG-525-RTS

Dear Ms. Retz:

Attached are errata pages to Rebuttal Exhibit DWD-2 to the Rebuttal Testimony of Atmos Energy Corporation witness Dylan W. D'Ascendis. The errata pages correct a formulaic error in Rebuttal Exhibit DWD-2.

On page 29 of Rebuttal Exhibit DWD-2, the last five companies incorrectly had the same dividend yield. The correction on page 29 flows through to page 28 and page 2 of Rebuttal Exhibit DWD-2.

Sincerely,

James G. Flaherty

jflaherty@andersonbyrd.com

JGF:rr Enclosure

ec: Service List

## <u>Atmos Energy Corporation</u> <u>Brief Summary of Common Equity Cost Rate</u>

		Proxy Group of Six Natural Gas
		Distribution
Line No.	Principal Methods	Companies
1.	Discounted Cash Flow Model (DCF) (1)	9.01%
2.	Risk Premium Model (RPM) (2)	9.64%
3.	Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) (3)	9.10%
4.	Market Models Applied to Comparable Risk, Non-Price Regulated Companies (4)	10.10%
5.	Indicated Common Equity Cost Rate before Adjustment for Company-Specific Risk	9.45%
6.	Size Risk Adjustment (5)	0.40%
7.	Flotation Cost Adjustment (6)	0.03%
8.	Indicated Common Equity Cost Rate	9.88%
9.	Recommended Common Equity Cost Rate	9.90%

Notes: (1) From page 3 of this Schedule.

- (2) From page 10 of this Schedule.
- (3) From page 23 of this Schedule.
- (4) From page 28 of this Schedule.
- (5) Size risk adjustment to reflect Atmos Energy's greater business risk due to its smaller size realtive to his Utility Proxy Group as detailed in Mr. D'Ascendis' direct testimony.
- (6) From page 34 of this Schedule.

Exhibit No. DWD-2 (Rebuttal) Schedule DWD-10 (Rebuttal) Page 28 of 35 Errata Page 2 of 3

## **Atmos Energy Corporation**

# Summary of Cost of Equity Models Applied to Proxy Group of Twenty Non-Price Regulated Companies Comparable in Total Risk to the Proxy Group of Six Natural Gas Distribution Companies

		Proxy Group Twenty Non Price Regulate	-
Principal Methods		Companies	
Discounted Cash Flow Model (DCF) (1)		9.97	%
Risk Premium Model (RPM) (2)		10.47	
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) (3)		10.03	_
	Mean	10.16	%
	Median	10.03	= _% =
	Average of Mean and Median	10.10	_%

### Notes:

- (1) From page 29 of this Schedule.
- (2) From page 30 of this Schedule.
- (3) From page 33 of this Schedule.

Exhibit No. DWD-2 (Rebuttal) Schedule DWD-10 (Rebuttal) Page 29 of 35 Errata Page 3 of 3

# Atmos Energy Corporation DCF Results for the Proxy Group of Non-Price-Regulated Companies Comparable in Total Risk to the <u>Proxy Group of Six Natural Gas Distribution Companies</u>

[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]

Proxy Group of Twenty Non-Price Regulated Companies	Average Dividend Yield	Value Line Projected Five Year Growth in EPS	Zack's Five Year Projected Growth Rate in EPS	Yahoo! Finance Projected Five Year Growth in EPS	Average Projected Five Year Growth Rate in EPS	Adjusted Dividend Yield	Indicated Common Equity Cost Rate (1)
Choe Global Markets. Inc.	1.23 %	14.50 %	9.00 %	2.75 %	8.75 %	1.28 %	10.03 %
Crown Castle International Corp	3.40	12.00	15.50	21.00	16.17	3.67	19.84
Church & Dwight Co., Inc.	1.20	9.00	8.80	8.31	8.70	1.25	9.95
CME Group Inc.	1.42	3.00	7.00	5.68	5.23	1.46	6.69
Forrester Research	-	8.50	12.00	12.00	10.83	-	NA
Cedar Fair, L.P.	6.62	10.50	7.00	6.00	7.83	6.88	14.71
Gen'l Mills	3.65	4.00	7.00	6.87	5.96	3.76	9.72
Hormel Foods	1.99	9.00	8.50	2.90	6.80	2.06	8.86
Hershey Co.	2.01	6.50	7.30	8.75	7.52	2.09	9.61
J&J Snack Foods	1.04	7.50	NA	6.00	6.75	1.08	7.83
Kellogg	3.62	4.00	4.50	(0.80)	4.25	3.70	7.95
Lancaster Colony	1.80	7.50	NA	3.00	5.25	1.85	7.10
Lilly (Eli)	2.32	11.50	10.60	10.55	10.88	2.45	13.33
McCormic & Co.	1.40	8.00	8.00	8.45	8.15	1.46	9.61
Altria Group	7.65	8.50	6.40	6.59	7.16	7.92	15.08
Smucker (J.M.)	3.25	5.00	3.70	3.30	4.00	3.32	7.32
Sysco Corporation	2.03	10.50	9.50	10.55	10.18	2.13	12.31
Tootsie Roll	0.99	5.50	NA	9.00	7.25	1.03	8.28
WD-40 Co.	1.33	8.50	NA	10.00	9.25	1.39	10.64
Walmart Inc.	1.83	7.50	4.70	4.56	5.59	1.88	7.47
						Mean	10.33 %
						Median	9.61 %
					Average of Mean	and Median	9.97 %

NA= Not Available NMF= Not Meaningful Figure

(1) The application of the DCF model to the domestic, non-price regluated comparable risk companies is identical to the application of the DCF to the utility proxy group. The dividend yield is derived by using the 60 day average price and the spot indicated dividend as of October 31, 2019. The dividend yield is then adjusted by 1/2 the average projected growth rate in EPS, which is calculated by averaging the 5 year projected growth in EPS provided by Value Line, www.zacks.com, and www.yahoo.com (excluding any negative growth rates) and then adding that growth rate to the adjusted dividend yield.

Source of Information:

Value Line Investment Survey www.zacks.com Downloaded on 10/31/2019 www.yahoo.com Downloaded on 10/31/2019

# BEFORE THE STATE CORPORATION COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF KANSAS

In the Matter of the Application of Atmos	)	
Energy Corporation for Adjustment of its	)	Docket No. 19-ATMG-525-RTS
Natural Gas Rates in the State of Kansas	)	

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the Errata Pages to Rebuttal Exhibit DWD-2 to the Rebuttal Testimony of Atmos Energy Corporation witness Dylan W. D'Ascendis in the captioned docket was sent via electronic mail this 4<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2019, addressed to:

Shelly M. Bass Della Smith

Shelly.Bass@atmosenergy.com d.smith@curb.kansas.gov

Jared N. Geiger Phoenix Z. Anshutz

<u>Jared.Geiger@atmosenergy.com</u> <u>p.anshutz@kcc.ks.gov</u>

Joseph R. Astrab Cole Bailey

j.astrab@curb.kansas.gov c.bailey@kcc.ks.gov

Todd E. Love Brian G. Fedotin

<u>t.love@curb.kansas.gov</u> <u>b.fedotin@kcc.ks.gov</u>

David W. Nickel

Robert Elliott Vincent

d.nickel@curb.kansas.gov r.vincent@kcc.ks.gov

Shonda Rabb James H. Jeffries

<u>s.rabb@curb.kansas.gov</u> <u>jjeffries@mcguirewoods.com</u>

/s/ James G. Flaherty

James G. Flaherty, #11177

ANDERSON & BYRD, LLP

216 S. Hickory, P. O. Box 17 Ottawa, Kansas 66067 (785) 242-1234, telephone

(785) 242-1279, facsimile

jflaherty@andersonbyrd.com

Attorneys for Atmos Energy Corporation